

John J. Duffy (SB No. 6224834)
Kevin M. Ringel (SB No. 6308106)
Margaret C. Redshaw (SB No. 6327480)
SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP
330 N Wabash, Suite 3300
Chicago, Illinois 60611
Tel: (312) 321-9100; Fax: (312) 321-0990
jduffy@smbtrials.com
kringel@smbtrials.com
mredshaw@smbtrials.com

Marc G. Cowden (SB No. 169391)
Adam Stoddard (SB No. 272691)
**SHEUERMAN, MARTINI, TABARI,
ZENERE & GARVIN**
1033 Willow Street
San Jose, California 95125
Tel: (408) 288-9700; Fax: (408) 295-9900
mcowden@smtlaw.com
astoddard@smtlaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Chart Inc.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE PACIFIC FERTILITY CENTER
LITIGATION

Case No. 3:18-cv-01586-JSC

This Document Relates to:
Case No. 3:18-cv-01586
(A.B., C.D., E.F., G.H., and I.J.)

**[PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING
DEFENDANT'S AMENDED
ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION NO. 2
TO FILE UNDER SEAL MOTION TO
EXCLUDE KASBEKAR AND
WININGER**

1 For good cause shown, the Court GRANTS Chart's Amended Administrative Motion No.
2 2 to File Under Seal Motion to Exclude Anand Kasbekar and David Wininger seeking to file
3 under seal:

4 ➤ Certain exhibits to the to the Declaration of Kevin M. Ringel in Support of Chart's
5 Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts Anand Kasbekar and David Wininger,
6 including:
7

- 8 ▪ Exhibit A – Expert Report of Anand Kasbekar dated November 6, 2020;
- 9 ▪ Exhibit B – Expert Rebuttal Report of Anand Kasbekar dated December 4,
10 2020;
- 11 ▪ Exhibit C - Deposition Transcript of Anand Kasbekar dated December 13,
12 2019;
- 13 ▪ Exhibit D - Deposition Transcript of Anand Kasbekar dated November 25,
14 2020;
- 15 ▪ Exhibit E - Deposition Transcript of Anand Kasbekar dated December 15,
16 2020;
- 17 ▪ Exhibit F – Amended Expert Report of David Wininger dated December 4,
18 2020;
- 19 ▪ Exhibit G – Deposition Transcript of David Wininger dated November 30,
20 2020;
- 21 ▪ Exhibit H – Expert Report of Franklin Miller dated November 20, 2020;
- 22 ▪ Exhibit I – Expert Rebuttal Report of Franklin Miller dated December 11, 2020;
- 23 ▪ Exhibit J - Deposition Transcript of Franklin Miller dated December 14, 2020;
- 24 and
25
26
27
28

- Exhibit K – Expert Rebuttal Report of Ron Parrington dated December 8, 2020.

The Court hereby ORDERS that the following portions of the exhibits to the Declaration of Kevin M. Ringel in Support of Chart’s Motion to Exclude Anand Kasbekar and David Wininger are to be maintained under seal:

Exhibit	Paragraph(s)	Designating Party
A	Figures 1-74; p. 4, ¶1, sentence 4; p. 5 ¶¶ 1, 3; p. 6 ¶2; pp. 10 - 37; p. 38 ¶¶ 2-3 pp. 39– 58; p. 60 No. 3-4; pp. 61-62; and p. 63 No. 10.	Chart
B	pp. 1-18; Figures 1-7.	Chart
C	23:3-24:8; 39:2-40:6; 53:24-54:15; 60:16-62:14; 67:24-69:16; 77:17-78:7; 88:3-111:23; 112:6-113:1; 114:4-129:13; 130:4-150:5; 164:5-169:14.	Chart
D	18:12-25; pp. 19-20; 21:1-11; 26:18-25; pp. 27-31; 32:1-10; 37:8-12; 51:22-25; pp. 52-64;	Chart

	65:1-17; 80:23-25; p. 84; 90:3-25; p. 91; 92:1-10; 93:11-25; pp. 94-95; 96:1-4; 97:15-25; pp. 98-111; 112:24-25 pp. 113-123; 124:1-20; 129:2-25; 130:1-12; 130:14-25; p. 131; 132:1-21.	
E	11:22-12:21; 13:20-25:24; 28:6-30:24; 33:21-42:13; 44:24-45:14; 52:10-55:19.	Chart
F	¶35; ¶38-40; ¶44; ¶47; ¶49-57; ¶59-60; ¶64-67; ¶70; Subheadings IV(B)(i)-(iv).	Plaintiffs
G	37:1-4, 22-24; and 77:2-25; 78; 79:1-2.	Chart

H	p. 4, ¶III.E(3); pp. 6-7, ¶IV.B; p. 8, Section V; pp. 12-22: ¶VI.B (incl. Figures 4-13); p. 23, Section VIII.	Chart
I	pp. 2-11 (incl. Figures 1-11).	Chart
J	11:6-15:1; 17:10-24:9; 25:21-27:1; 31:2-33:6; 37:18-44:22; 53:11-25 54:1-57:25; 79:13-85:11.	Chart
K	pp. 1-9; Appendix 3-20, including Table 1-5 and Figure 1-14.	Chart

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: _____

The Honorable Jacqueline Scott Corley